

## A MEASURE ZERO SET IN THE PLANE WITH ABSOLUTELY NONMEASURABLE LINEAR SECTIONS

ALEXANDER KHARAZISHVILI

**Abstract.** It is proved that there exists a translation invariant extension  $\mu$  of the two-dimensional Lebesgue measure  $\lambda_2$  on the plane  $\mathbf{R}^2$  such that  $\mu$  is metrically isomorphic to  $\lambda_2$  and all linear sections of some  $\mu$ -measure zero set are absolutely nonmeasurable.

Throughout this paper, we use the following fairly standard notation.

$X \triangle Y$  is the symmetric difference of two sets  $X$  and  $Y$ ;

$\text{dom}(f)$  is the domain of a function  $f$ ;

$\text{card}(X)$  is the cardinality of a set  $X$ ;

$\omega$  is the least infinite ordinal (cardinal) number;

$\mathbf{R}$  is the real line equipped with the group of all its translations;

$\mathbf{c}$  is the cardinality of the continuum, i.e.,  $\mathbf{c}$  is  $\text{card}(\mathbf{R})$ ;

$\lambda$  is the standard one-dimensional Lebesgue measure on  $\mathbf{R}$ ;

$\mathbf{R}^n$  is the Euclidean  $n$ -dimensional space equipped with the group of all its translations;

$\lambda_n$  is the standard  $n$ -dimensional Lebesgue measure on  $\mathbf{R}^n$  (in particular,  $\lambda_1 = \lambda$ ).

As is widely known, if  $Z$  is a  $\lambda_2$ -measure zero subset of the Euclidean plane  $\mathbf{R}^2$ , then almost all (with respect to  $\lambda$ ) linear sections of  $Z$ , parallel to the coordinate axes, i.e.,  $\lambda$ -almost all sets of the form

$$\begin{aligned} \{y : (x, y) \in Z\} & \quad (x \in \mathbf{R}), \\ \{x : (x, y) \in Z\} & \quad (y \in \mathbf{R}), \end{aligned}$$

are of  $\lambda$ -measure zero. This fact is a direct consequence of Fubini's classical theorem. More generally, it follows from the same theorem that if  $l$  is any straight line in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ , then  $\lambda$ -almost all linear sections of  $Z$ , parallel to  $l$ , are of  $\lambda$ -measure zero.

The main goal of the present paper is to show that for a certain translation invariant extension  $\mu$  of  $\lambda_2$ , which is metrically isomorphic to  $\lambda_2$ , the above-mentioned fact fails to be true in a very strong sense.

For our further purposes, we need some auxiliary notions from the general theory of invariant (quasi-invariant) measures (see, e.g., [1, 6, 11]).

Let  $E$  be an infinite ground set and let  $G$  be a group of transformations of  $E$ .

A nonzero complete  $\sigma$ -finite measure  $\theta$  on  $E$  is called quasi-invariant with respect to  $G$  (in short,  $G$ -quasi-invariant) if the domain of  $\theta$  is a  $G$ -invariant  $\sigma$ -algebra of subsets of  $E$  and the family of all  $\theta$ -measure zero sets is a  $G$ -invariant  $\sigma$ -ideal of subsets of  $E$ .

A set  $X \subset E$  is called almost  $G$ -invariant in  $E$  if for every transformation  $g \in G$  one has

$$\text{card}(g(X) \triangle X) < \text{card}(E).$$

Almost  $G$ -invariant subsets of  $E$  play an important role in many topics of general topology and of the theory of invariant (quasi-invariant) measures (see, e.g., [1–4, 6, 10, 11]).

A set  $Y \subset E$  is called  $G$ -absolutely nonmeasurable if for every nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite  $G$ -quasi-invariant measure  $\mu$  on  $E$  one has  $Y \notin \text{dom}(\mu)$ .

---

2020 *Mathematics Subject Classification.* 28A05, 28D05.

*Key words and phrases.* Invariant (quasi-invariant) measure; Almost invariant set; Measure zero set; Absolutely nonmeasurable set.

In other words,  $Y \subset E$  is  $G$ -absolutely nonmeasurable if  $Y$  is absolutely nonmeasurable with respect to the class of all nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite  $G$ -quasi-invariant measures on  $E$ .

In particular, if  $E$  is a group, then one can take as  $G$  the group of all left translations of  $E$ . In such a case, identifying  $E$  and  $G$ , one can speak of  $E$ -absolutely nonmeasurable subsets of  $E$ .

**Lemma 1.** *Let  $(G, +)$  be an uncountable commutative group identified with the group of all its translations, and let  $Y$  be a subset of  $G$ .*

*The following two assertions are equivalent:*

(1) *there exists a countable family  $\{g_j : j \in J\}$  of elements of  $G$  such that*

$$\cup\{g_j + Y : j \in J\} = G;$$

(2) *there exists a  $G$ -absolutely nonmeasurable set entirely contained in  $Y$ .*

For a detailed proof of Lemma 1, see [7].

We shall use this lemma in the special case where  $G$  is a group, isomorphic to the additive group of  $\mathbf{R}$ .

More precisely, let  $l$  be any straight line in the plane  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . For  $l$ , we may consider the family  $G_l$  of all those translations  $g$  of  $\mathbf{R}^2$  which satisfy  $g(l) = l$ . In other words,  $G_l$  is the stabilizer of  $l$  in the group of all translations of  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . Also,  $l$  is equipped with the isomorphic image  $\mu_l$  of  $\lambda$  and  $\mu_l$  is invariant with respect to  $G_l$ . But there are many other measures on  $l$  which are invariant (or, more generally, quasi-invariant) under  $G_l$ . Let us denote by  $\mathcal{M}_l$  the class of all nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite  $G_l$ -quasi-invariant measures on  $l$  (notice that the domains of such measures are various  $G_l$ -invariant  $\sigma$ -algebras of subsets of  $l$ ).

According to the general definition presented above, we say that a set  $Y \subset l$  is  $G_l$ -absolutely nonmeasurable in  $l$  if  $Y$  is nonmeasurable with respect to each measure from the class  $\mathcal{M}_l$ .

Using Lemma 1, it is not hard to show the validity of the next auxiliary statement.

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $l$  be a straight line in the plane  $\mathbf{R}^2$  and let  $X$  be a set in  $l$  such that  $\text{card}(l \setminus X) < \mathbf{c}$ . Then  $X$  contains a  $G_l$ -absolutely nonmeasurable subset of  $l$ .*

*Proof.* Since  $\text{card}(l \setminus X) < \mathbf{c}$ , there is an element  $g \in G_l$  such that

$$(g + (l \setminus X)) \cap (l \setminus X) = \emptyset$$

or, equivalently,

$$(g + X) \cup X = l.$$

Now, taking into account Lemma 1, we conclude that  $X$  contains some  $G_l$ -absolutely nonmeasurable set.  $\square$

**Lemma 3.** *There exists a set  $Z \subset \mathbf{R}^2$  which satisfies the following three conditions:*

- (1)  *$Z$  is almost  $\mathbf{R}^2$ -invariant, i.e.,  $\text{card}((h + Z) \Delta Z) < \mathbf{c}$  for every  $h \in \mathbf{R}^2$ ;*
- (2) *the inner  $\lambda_2$ -measure of the set  $Z$  is equal to zero;*
- (3) *for any straight line  $l$  in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ , the set  $l \setminus Z$  has cardinality strictly less than  $\mathbf{c}$ .*

*Proof.* We follow the argument used in [5].

Let  $\alpha$  be the least ordinal number of cardinality  $\mathbf{c}$ . We introduce the following notation.

$\{l_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  is the injective family of all straight lines in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ .

$\{F_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  is the family of all closed subsets of  $\mathbf{R}^2$  having strictly positive  $\lambda_2$ -measure.

$\{G_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  is a family of groups of translations of  $\mathbf{R}^2$  such that:

- (a)  $\{G_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  is increasing by the standard inclusion relation;
- (b)  $\text{card}(G_\xi) \leq \text{card}(\xi) + \omega$  for each ordinal  $\xi < \alpha$ ;
- (c)  $\cup\{G_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  is the group of all translations of  $\mathbf{R}^2$ .

Further, we construct by transfinite recursion a family  $\{z'_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  of points of  $\mathbf{R}^2$ .

Suppose that for an ordinal  $\xi < \alpha$ , the partial family  $\{z'_\zeta : \zeta < \xi\}$  has already been defined. Let us put

$$L_\xi = G_\xi(\cup\{l_\zeta : \zeta < \xi\}) \cup G_\xi(\{z'_\zeta : \zeta < \xi\}).$$

Keeping in mind the fact that  $\lambda_2(F_\xi) > 0$ , it is not hard to show that there exists a point  $z' \in F_\xi \setminus L_\xi$ . Then we define  $z'_\xi = z'$ .

Proceeding in this manner, we obtain the required  $\alpha$ -sequence  $\{z'_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  of points of  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . It follows from the above construction that the set

$$Z' = \cup\{G_\xi(z'_\xi) : \xi < \alpha\}$$

is almost  $\mathbf{R}^2$ -invariant and  $\lambda_2$ -thick in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . Moreover, it is not difficult to check that

$$\text{card}(Z' \cap l) < \mathfrak{c}$$

for every straight line  $l$  in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . These properties of  $Z'$  imply that the set

$$Z = \mathbf{R}^2 \setminus Z'$$

satisfies all conditions (1), (2) and (3) of Lemma 3, so is as required. □

**Lemma 4.** *Let  $Z$  be a subset of  $\mathbf{R}^2$  as in Lemma 3.*

*There exists a complete translation invariant measure  $\mu$  on  $\mathbf{R}^2$  such that:*

- (1)  $\mu$  is an extension of  $\lambda_2$ ;
- (2)  $Z \in \text{dom}(\mu)$  and  $\mu(Z) = 0$ ;
- (3) every  $\mu$ -measurable set  $X \subset \mathbf{R}^2$  admits a representation in the form

$$X = (X_0 \cup A) \setminus B,$$

where  $X_0 \in \text{dom}(\lambda_2)$  and  $\mu(A) = \mu(B) = 0$  (in particular, the measures  $\mu$  and  $\lambda_2$  are metrically isomorphic).

*Proof.* Since  $Z$  satisfies conditions (1), (2) and (3) of Lemma 3, the required measure  $\mu$  is obtained in the standard manner, by applying Marczewski's method of extending measures (see, e.g., [8,9,11]). Moreover, slightly modifying the transfinite construction of  $Z$ , it can be established that  $\mu$  is a measure invariant under the group of all isometric transformations of  $\mathbf{R}^2$ . □

Using the above lemmas, we can prove the following statement.

**Theorem 1.** *For the measure  $\mu$  indicated in Lemma 4, there exists a set  $W \subset \mathbf{R}^2$  such that:*

- (1)  $W \subset Z$  and, consequently,  $\mu(W) = 0$ ;
- (2) for any straight line  $l$  in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ , the set  $l \cap W$  is  $G_1$ -absolutely nonmeasurable.

Let  $\alpha$  be the least ordinal number of cardinality  $\mathfrak{c}$ . We again denote by  $\{l_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  the injective family of all straight lines in  $\mathbf{R}^2$ .

Using the method of transfinite recursion, we construct a disjoint family  $\{W_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$  of sets which fulfil the following two conditions:

- (a)  $W_\xi \subset l_\xi \cap Z$  for each ordinal  $\xi < \alpha$ ;
- (b)  $W_\xi$  is  $G_{l_\xi}$ -absolutely nonmeasurable for each ordinal  $\xi < \alpha$ .

Assume that, for an ordinal  $\xi < \alpha$ , the partial disjoint family  $\{W_\zeta : \zeta < \xi\}$  of sets has already been constructed so that

$$W_\zeta \subset l_\zeta \quad (\zeta < \xi).$$

Take the straight line  $l_\xi$  and consider the set

$$P_\xi = (Z \cap l_\xi) \setminus \cup\{l_\zeta : \zeta < \xi\}.$$

Since  $\text{card}(l_\xi \setminus Z) < \mathfrak{c}$ , it is not difficult to verify that

$$\text{card}(l_\xi \setminus P_\xi) < \mathfrak{c}.$$

According to Lemma 2, there exists a set  $T \subset P_\xi$  which is  $G_{l_\xi}$ -absolutely nonmeasurable. We then define  $W_\xi = T$ .

Proceeding in this manner, we get the disjoint family of sets  $\{W_\xi : \xi < \alpha\}$ . Finally, putting

$$W = \cup\{W_\xi : \xi < \alpha\},$$

we obtain the set  $W$  satisfying conditions (1) and (2) of Theorem 1.

The next auxiliary statement generalizes Lemma 2 to the case of  $\mathbf{R}^n$ .

**Lemma 5.** *Let  $n \geq 1$  be a natural number and let  $\{\Gamma_j : j \in J\}$  be a family of affine hyperplanes in the Euclidean space  $\mathbf{R}^n$  such that  $\text{card}(J) < \mathfrak{c}$ .*

*Then the set  $\mathbf{R}^n \setminus \cup\{\Gamma_j : j \in J\}$  contains an  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -absolutely nonmeasurable subset.*

This lemma can be deduced from the general Lemma 1.

Using Lemma 5, we obtain an analog of Theorem 1 for the space  $\mathbf{R}^n$  and for the Lebesgue measure  $\lambda_n$ , where  $n \geq 3$ .

**Theorem 2.** *For any natural number  $n \geq 3$ , there exist a complete measure  $\nu$  on  $\mathbf{R}^n$  and a set  $V \subset \mathbf{R}^n$  such that:*

- (1)  $\nu$  extends  $\lambda_n$  and is invariant under the group of all isometric transformations of  $\mathbf{R}^n$ ;
- (2)  $\nu$  is metrically isomorphic to  $\lambda_n$ ;
- (3)  $\nu(V) = 0$ ;
- (4) for every affine hyperplane  $\Gamma$  in  $\mathbf{R}^n$ , the set  $V \cap \Gamma$  is absolutely nonmeasurable with respect to the class of all nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite translation quasi-invariant measures on  $\Gamma$ .

A set  $U \subset \mathbf{R}^n$  is called  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -negligible in  $\mathbf{R}^n$  if  $U$  satisfies the following two relations:

- (i) there exists at least one nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -quasi-invariant measure  $\theta$  such that  $U \in \text{dom}(\theta)$  (equivalently,  $U$  is not  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -absolutely nonmeasurable);
- (ii) for every  $\sigma$ -finite  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -quasi-invariant measure  $\theta'$  such that  $U \in \text{dom}(\theta')$ , the equality  $\theta'(U) = 0$  holds true.

Some structural properties of  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -negligible sets are considered in [4] and [6].

It would be interesting to study the question of whether there exists an  $\mathbf{R}^n$ -negligible set  $U \subset \mathbf{R}^n$  such that, for any affine hyperplane  $\Gamma$  in  $\mathbf{R}^n$ , the set  $U \cap \Gamma$  is absolutely nonmeasurable with respect to the class of all nonzero  $\sigma$ -finite translation quasi-invariant measures on  $\Gamma$ .

#### ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This work was partially supported by the Shota Rustaveli National Science Foundation of Georgia, Grant FR-18-6190.

#### REFERENCES

1. E. Hewitt, K. A. Ross, *Abstract Harmonic Analysis*. vol. I: Structure of topological groups. Integration theory, group representations. Die Grundlehren der mathematischen Wissenschaften, Bd. 115 Academic Press, Inc., Publishers, New York; Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Göttingen-Heidelberg, 1963.
2. A. Hulanicki, Invariant extensions of the Lebesgue measure. *Fund. Math.* **51** (1962/63), 111–115.
3. S. Kakutani, J. C. Oxtoby, Construction of a non-separable invariant extension of the Lebesgue measure space. *Ann. of Math. (2)* **52** (1950), 580–590.
4. A. Kharazishvili, *Invariant Extensions of Lebesgue Measure*. (Russian) Tbilis. Gos. Univ., Tbilisi, 1983.
5. A. Kharazishvili, Subsets of the plane with small linear sections and invariant extensions of the two-dimensional Lebesgue measure. *Georgian Math. J.* **6** (1999), no. 5, 441–446.
6. A. Kharazishvili, *Topics in Measure Theory and Real Analysis*. Atlantis Studies in Mathematics, 2. Atlantis Press, Paris; World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd., Hackensack, NJ, 2009.
7. A. Kharazishvili, A characterization of sets containing absolutely nonmeasurable subsets. *Georgian Math. J.* **24** (2017), no. 2, 211–215.
8. E. Marczewski (E. Szpilrajn), Sur l'extension de la mesure lebesguienne. *Fund. Math.* **25** (1935), no. 1, 551–558.
9. E. Marczewski (E. Szpilrajn), On problems of the theory of measure. (Russian) *Uspekhi Mat. Nauk.* vol. 1, **12** (1946), no. 2, 179–188.
10. J. C. Oxtoby, *Measure and Category*. A survey of the analogies between topological and measure spaces. Graduate Texts in Mathematics, vol. 2. Springer-Verlag, New York-Berlin, 1971.
11. Sh. S. Pkhakadze, The theory of Lebesgue measure. (Russian) *Akad. Nauk Gruzin. SSR. Trudy Tbiliss. Mat. Inst. Razmadze* **25** (1958), 3–271.

(Received 28.06.2020)

A. RAZMADZE MATHEMATICAL INSTITUTE OF I. JAVAKHISHVILI TBILISI STATE UNIVERSITY, 6 TAMARASHVILI STR., TBILISI 0177, GEORGIA

I. VEKUA INSTITUTE OF APPLIED MATHEMATICS, 2 UNIVERSITY STR., TBILISI 0186, GEORGIA  
E-mail address: kharaz2@yahoo.com